BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04855 7268

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2000 - 2001

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, Faith Teo, Wendy Adams and Paul Broad

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
DEC - 5 2000
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2000 - 2001

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, Faith Teo,
Wendy Adams and Paul Broad

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma01roge_2

FAMILY LAW

Table of Contents

Volume I

Page No.

I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents....1
Vanier Institute, *Profiling Canada's Families* 2
Moge v. Moge 3
Mossop v. Canada....4
Barrett and McIntosh, *The Anti-Social Family*....4
Thorne, *Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions* 5
La Novara, *A Portrait of Families in Canada* 7
Vanier Institute, *Profiling Canada's Families* 9
Globe and Mail, "Family alive and well, study finds" 9
Toronto Star, " 'Typical' family has vanished, report says" 10
Baker, "Family Trends and Family Policies" 12
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family"....16

B. Legal Regulation of the Family

Balfour v. Balfour 22
Olsen, "The Family and the Market"....23
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family" 28
Eekelaar, *Family Law and Social Policy*....30
Glendon, *Abortion and Divorce in Western Law*....36

II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

A. The Significance of Marriage

Blackstone, *Commentaries on the Laws of England* 38
Cobbett, *Advice to Young Men and (incidentally) to Young Women*....38
Globe and Mail, "Canadian marriage rates go into dive"....39
Barr, *Basic Facts on Families in Canada*....40
Vanier Institute, *Profiling Canada's Families* 40
Cox, "Alternative Families" 43
Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* 43

Hyde v. Hyde 44
Graham v. Graham 44
Day, "The Charter and Family Law" 47
Note: The Significance of Marriage for Aboriginal Women 48
Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" 49

B. Unmarried Cohabitation

Note: Terminology 59
Globe and Mail, "Common-law gains cachet" 59
Holland, "Cohabitation and Marriage—A Meeting at the Crossroads?" 61
Glendon, *The Transformation of Family Law*, "Informal Family Relations" 66
Note: The Legislative Treatment of Unmarried Couples in Ontario 68
Miron v. Trudel 70
Note: Determining Whether Unmarried Persons are "Spouses" 75
Molodowich v. Penttinen 76
Stoikiewicz v. Filas 80
Le Labbe and McCullough 82
Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act* (1993) 84

C. Validity of Marriage

(a) Overview

Hahlo, "Nullity of Marriage in Canada" 87
Hovius, Note on Validity of Marriage 88
McLeod, "Validity of Marriage" from *Introduction to Family Law* 89

(b) Monogamy

Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* 93
Note: Bigamous and Polygamous Relationships 94
Lawyer's Weekly, "Polygamous spouses covered under B.C. family legislation, judge holds" 96
Globe and Mail, "Community practises polygamy" 98
New York Times, "My Husband's Nine Wives" 100
Globe and Mail, "France Moves to Stem Polygamy" 101
Note: Serial Polygamy 104

(c) Capacity to Consummate

Gajamugan v. Gajamugan 105
Dashevsky v. Dashevsky 107
Norman v. Norman 110

(d) Opposite Sexes

B. v. A. 112
Layland v. Ontario 118
Law, "Homosexuality and the Social Meaning of Gender" 124
Duclos, "An Argument for Legal Recognition of Same Sex Marriage" 125
Note: The "Registered Partnership" in Europe 127
Note: *Baehr v. Lewin* 128
Note: Same-Sex Couples and Extended Definitions of "Spouse" 129
Anderson v. Luoma 129
Note: Challenges to Benefits Programmes 132
Mossop v. Canada 132
Egan v. Canada 139
Globe and Mail, "Idea of extending benefits revived by Justice Minister" 147
Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act* (1993) 148
Note: Ontario Bill 167 152
M. v. H. 153
Note: B.C. Same-Sex Legislation 163
Note: *Rosenberg v. Canada* 163

(e) Age Requirements for a Valid Marriage 163

The Guardian Weekly, "Romantic Dilemma for Child Bride" 164

(f) Consent as a Requirement for a Valid Marriage 165

III DIVORCE

A. The Social Context of Divorce

Barr, *Basic Facts on Families in Canada* 167
Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crises on Marriage Breakdown 168
Richards, "Divorcing Children: Roles for Parents and the State" 170

B. Reform of Divorce Law

(a) The Movement to No-Fault Divorce

Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" 173
Abella, "Opening Address" in Sloss, ed., *Family Law in Canada* 176
Bissett-Johnson and Day, *The New Divorce Act* 179
Dept. Of Justice, *Evaluation of the Divorce Act* 182
Note: Divorce Reform in England 187

(b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce

R.E.A.L. Women, "Easy Divorce?" 188
Weitzman, "Divorce and the Illusion of Equality" 190
Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children" 194
Note: Other Critiques of No-Fault Divorce 195
Globe and Mail, "Putting the 'fault' back in no-fault divorce" 200
Lawyer's Weekly, "Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?" 202
Note: *Valenti v. Valenti* 205
Note: Tort of Emotional Distress 206

(c) Grounds for Divorce

(i) Living Separate and Apart

Rushton v. Rushton 209
Dupere v. Dupere 210
Note: Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division under the *Family Law Act* 212
Note: Alternative to Separation as a "No-Fault" Ground for Divorce.....212

(ii) Adultery

Bissett-Johnson and Day, *The New Divorce Law*, Definition of Adultery 213
Glendon, *The Transformation of Family Law* 213
Globe and Mail, "Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge" 214
Lawyer's Weekly, re Brazilian defence of honour 215
Mastalerz v. Garland 216
Davenport v. Miller 218

(iii) Cruelty

Knoll v. Knoll.....221
Austin v. Austin.....224
Gilbert v. Gilbert.....225
B.(Y.) v. B.(J.).....229

(d) Bars to Proceedings

(i) Condonation, Connivanace, Collusion

Davies, *Family Law in Canada*, "Condonation".....231
Guglielmo v. Mikhail (*Lawyer's Weekly*).....233
Davies, *Family Law in Canada*, "Connivance" and "Collusion".....234

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support.....254

(iii) Removal of Barriers to Religious Divorce

Globe and Mail, "Ties that continue to bind".....237
Globe and Mail, "Religious laws to be removed as bargaining chip' in divorces".....240

C. Institutional Reforms: Mediation

Landau, "Mediation: An Option for Divorcing Families".....241
Woods, "Mediation: A Backlash to Women's Progress on Family Law Issues".....245
Payne and Overend, "Divorce Mediation: An Overview of Process and Strategies".....247

IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN

A. The Economics of Marriage

Vanier Institute, *Profiling Canada's Families*.....256
Statistics Canada, *Women in the Labour Force*.....259
Note: 1995 Statistics on Women's Labour Force Participation.....261
Moller Okin, *Justice, Gender and the Family*.....261
Gunderson, *Women and Labour Market Poverty*.....262

B. The Economic Consequences of Divorce

Vanier Institute, *Profiling Canada's Families*.....265
Willick v. Willick.....267

Note: Poverty Statistics for 1995 268
Rogerson, "Winning the Battle, Losing the War" 268
Note: Economic Consequences of Divorce 272
Lawyers Weekly, "Women suffer financially post-divorce while men benefit: Satscan study" 273
Lawyers Weekly, "Family law reform can't solve divorce poverty?" 275